

DOI: 10.31891/2308-4081/2023-13(1)-3

Doctor of Science (in Pedagogy), Full Professor SVITLANA HRYSHCHENKO, Taras Shevchenko National University «Chernihiv Colehium» E-mail: intensiv3000@meta.ua ORCID ID: 0000-0002-7981-3578

#### CURRENT PROBLEMS OF IMPLEMENTING INCLUSIVE EDUCATION IN EDUCATIONAL INSTITUTIONS OF UKRAINE AND COUNTRIES OF THE EUROPEAN UNION

#### ABSTRACT

The article analyzes current problems of implementing inclusive education in educational institutions of Ukraine and countries of the European Union. Various specific aspects of inclusive education in European countries are highlighted. It is substantiated that there is a need to stimulate the use of the best world experience in the implementation of inclusive education in different countries. An important aspect is ensuring effective investment into inclusive education both in Ukraine and in the countries of the European Union.

The purpose of the article is to analyze the experience of implementing inclusive education in the countries of the European Union and Ukraine.

It is defined that the implementation of inclusive education in Ukrainian educational system has a number of urgent problems that must be solved, namely: the lack of a clear mechanism for the implementation of inclusive education; the lack of a unified approach to understanding the terms used in the process of obtaining an education by people with special educational needs; the need to introduce inclusive education at all levels of education in Ukraine; different sub-departments of educational institutions (special and general); the need to review the mechanism of state financing of educational institutions that provide inclusive educational services; introduction of broad educational work among the population regarding the necessity and positive nature of the implementation of inclusive education.

Current problems of inclusive education in the European Union are as follows: increasing the quality and significance of inclusive education; increasing the number of graduates and reducing the number of people who do not graduate from educational institutions; review and preparation of educational programs that will meet the needs of people with special educational needs in education; stimulating the use of world leading experience in teaching and scientific research; providing higher education students with wider opportunities to acquire additional skills through study and internships abroad; strengthening links between inclusive education, research and business; ensuring effective investment into inclusive education.

*Keywords*: inclusive education, countries of the European Union, Ukraine, educational institutions, people with special educational needs.

## АКТУАЛЬНІ ПРОБЛЕМИ ВПРОВАДЖЕННЯ ІНКЛЮЗИВНОЇ ОСВІТИ В ЗВО УКРАЇНИ ТА КРАЇН ЄВРОПЕЙСЬКОГО СОЮЗУ

# АНОТАЦІЯ

У статті проаналізовано актуальні проблеми впровадження інклюзивного навчання в закладах освіти України та країн Європейського Союзу. Висвітлено різні специфічні аспекти інклюзивного навчання європейських країн. Обґрунтовано, що



існує потреба стимулювання використання передового світового досвіду у впровадженні інклюзивного навчання в різних країнах. Важливим аспектом є забезпечення ефективного інвестування в процес інклюзивного навчання як в Україні, так і в країнах Європейського Союзу.

Мета статті — проаналізувати досвід реалізації інклюзивного навчання в країнах Європейського Союзу та України.

З'ясовано, що впровадження інклюзивного навчання в українську освітню систему має низку актуальних проблем, які потребують вирішення: відсутність чіткого механізму реалізації інклюзивного навчання; відсутність єдиного підходу до розуміння термінів, які використовуються у процесі здобуття освіти особами з особливими освітніми потребами; необхідність запровадження інклюзивного навчання на всіх рівнях освіти України; різна підвідомчість закладів освіти (спеціальних і загальних); необхідність перегляду механізму державного фінансування закладів освіти, які надають інклюзивні освітні послуги; запровадження широкої просвітницької роботи серед населення щодо необхідності та позитивності впровадження інклюзивного навчання.

Актуальними проблемами інклюзивного навчання в Європейському Союзі є такі: підвищення якості та значущості інклюзивного навчання; збільшення кількості випускників та скорочення осіб, які не закінчують освітні заклади; перегляд та підготовка навчальних програм, які задовольнятимуть потреби осіб з особливими освітніми потребами, що здобувають освіту; стимулювання використання передового світового досвіду у викладанні та наукових дослідженнях; надання ширишх можливостей здобувачам вищої освіти в отриманні додаткових навичок шляхом навчання та стажування за кордоном; зміцнення зв'язків між інклюзивним навчанням, дослідженнями і бізнесом; забезпечення ефективного інвестування в інклюзивне навчання.

**Ключові слова**: інклюзивне навчання, країни Європейського Союзу, Україна, заклади освіти, люди з особливими потребами у навчанні.

## **INTRODUCTION**

Studying the experience of implementing inclusive education of children with special educational needs in the countries of the European Union and Ukraine proves that the problem is not sufficiently researched. Ukraine and all European countries have specifics in the implementation of inclusion in educational institutions. At the same time, there are common trends and differences in the implementation of inclusive education in educational institutions of European countries. Research studies in the field of inclusive education abroad cover the transition from special education differentiation to inclusive education. Inclusive education is a part of educational and general social policy of European states.

## THE AIM OF THE STUDY

The purpose of the article is to analyze the experience of implementing inclusive education in the countries of the European Union and Ukraine.

#### THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK AND RESEARCH METHODS

Theoretical foundations of inclusive education were developed by such foreign scientists as D. Rogers, E. Rogers, M. Yell and others. Various aspects of inclusive education in Ukraine and in European countries were also studied by domestic scientists – O. Glushko, C. Kravchenko, O. Lokshina, L. Myskiv, N. Nikolska, I. Sadova, O. Shparyk, M. Tymenko, A. Zhurylo and others.



The research was carried out using general scientific methods (study, analysis and generalization of reference information, review of scientific and educational printed and online sources), as well as systematization and generalization.

#### RESULTS

In the result of our research, it was found out that European and Ukrainian experience of implementing inclusive education in educational institutions has its own specifics for each country.

Current problems that must be solved in Ukraine are: the lack of a clear mechanism for the implementation of inclusive education; the lack of a unified approach to understanding the terms used in the process of obtaining an education by people with special educational needs; the importance of implementing the strategy and the National Action Plan for the implementation of inclusive education in preschool education institutions (early diagnosis and correction of the problems), general secondary education, vocational and technical education, and higher education; an identification of a separate body responsible for the organization of education for people with special educational needs (in Ukraine, it is the Ministry of Education and Science of Ukraine). It is important to redistribute the subordination of educational and rehabilitation institutions and introduce educational work among the population regarding the necessity and positivity of the implementation of inclusive education (Rozporiadzhennia Kabinetu Ministriv Ukrainy № 245-r, 2011). Both for Ukraine and for foreign countries, there is an acute problem of reducing the network of special educational institutions and creating resource centers for inclusive education on their basis (Myskiv, 2013) as well as of creating an effective system for evaluating the quality of education, in particular inclusive. There are global systems for assessing the quality of education, which are classified according to the nature of management into centralized and decentralized systems for determining the quality of education (Zahalnoderzhavna prohrama, 2009; Postanova Kabinetu Ministriv Ukrainy № 872, 2011).

For our research, it is important to refer to the foreign experience of inclusive education in educational institutions. It should be noted that the program document of the European Union "Modernization of higher education in Europe: financing and social aspects" defines the priority areas of education reform. We must also state that the basis of financial aid for education in Europe is grants from the European Union. However, despite the fact that global trends of investing in education are constantly growing, both domestic and foreign researchers believe that the potential of European educational institutions in the field of inclusive education is currently underutilized.

In our opinion, it is necessary to study the features of inclusive education in the following countries: Western Europe (Germany, Belgium, the Netherlands, and Austria); Northern Europe (Great Britain, Denmark, Sweden, Ireland, and Iceland); Southern Europe (Italy, Spain, and Portugal); Eastern Europe (Poland, Hungary, and Lithuania).

We will briefly consider the specifics of inclusive education in some European countries. Regarding German inclusive education, it is regulated by a special normative act – Recommendations on the organization of special education. The main body of implementation of inclusive education is the Ministry of Education, Religion and Culture. There function pedagogical centers of psychological and pedagogical support in the system of the Ministry of Education, Religion and Culture. There is a system of general and special educational institutions in the education system and they interact. Medical and social services as well as resource centers are financed and rehabilitation institutions are entrusted



to local self-government bodies. The duty of local self-government bodies is to provide psychological and pedagogical support for children with special needs in the process of obtaining education. In the system of higher education, the legislation provides for special study conditions for people with special educational needs (Myskiv, 2014; Lokshina et al., 2021).

Considering the specifics of Belgian inclusive education, we should note that it is regulated by special normative acts (the Law «On Special Education» and the Government Decree of 1978). There exists a system of general and special education, and eight types of special educational institutions function. There is legislative regulation of the functioning of psychological-medical-social support centers for school systems and correction of the social background for people with special educational needs in the system of general education. General (inclusive) and special educational institutions can be established by ministries, municipal bodies, public associations and private individuals. The financial support of inclusive education institutions rests with the founder (Myskiv, 2014).

Austrian inclusive education is characterized by a combination of general and special education for people with special educational needs and by the presence of six types of educational institutions in the system of special education. State control over education for people with special needs is entrusted to state centers of special education, which exercise their powers boh in special and general educational institutions (Myskiv, 2014; Lokshina et al., 2021).

For our research, it is important to determine the specific features of the Dutch inclusive education. They include: regulation of the education for people with special needs by the state educational project "Internal Support"; combination of general and special education for people with special needs; five types of educational institutions for special education; lack of special conditions for obtaining higher education; resting the responsibility regarding the placement of children who need a special approach and psychological and pedagogical support on the educational institutions; development of the procedure for providing psychological and pedagogical support and conducting corrective work; assessment of the level of development and educational achievements; formation and functioning of school internal support services (Myskiv, 2014; Lokshina et al., 2021). We must state that all the listed specific features are important for inclusive education in Ukraine.

Regarding inclusive education in Great Britain, there are much more features than in other European countries, namely: "availability of general and special education for people with special needs, regulated by the Act on Education, the Act on Special Needs in Education and Disability, the Act on Equality. The system of special education is represented by the functioning of eleven types of special educational institutions" (Myskiv, 2014). Responsibilities for the integration of children with special needs into the general education space are assigned to local education bodies, whereas territorial communities are entrusted with the responsibility of organizing support services for people with special educational needs. Financial support is entrusted to the Department of Education. "The functioning of inclusive education in higher educational institutions requires the mandatory availability of the position of an adviser or coordinator on issues of education of people with special needs and the approval of the Regulation on people with special needs. A system of motivations for higher education institutions has been developed through subsidies for the organization of an inclusive educational process, in particular concerning personnel issues" (Myskiv, 2014; Lokshina et al., 2021).



Inclusive education in Sweden has the following features: availability of general and special education for people with special needs regulated by the Law "On Secondary Education"; the functioning of a specially authorized state body – the Agency for Special Education under the Ministry of Education of the country; entrusting material and organizational issues of inclusive education to municipal bodies; financial motivation of general educational institutions to provide inclusive educational services. "The system of special educational institutions is represented by the functioning of four types of educational institutions and Child Rehabilitation Centers. Within the framework of the higher education system, people with special educational needs have the right to obtain bachelor's, master's, and doctor's degrees" (Myskiv, 2014).

The features of Italian inclusive education are as follows: availability of general and special education for people with special needs (90 % of children study in general secondary education institutions), regulated by the Law "On Education", Annexes to the Law "On Education" and the Law "On Integration of Children with Certain Problems"; the presence of specially authorized bodies at the educational departments of the country's provinces (advisory services); social guarantees in higher education for people with special needs; an extensive system of financial support – state, municipal and public organizations (Myskiv, 2014; Lokshina et al., 2021).

We must state that inclusive education in the countries of Eastern Europe is characterized by the organization of education for children with special needs in the conditions of general education and special educational institutions. The specificity of the Polish system is a small number of special educational institutions. In the system of the Ministry of Education of Lithuania, there is a separate structural unit – the Department of Special Education. However, among the countries of Eastern Europe, it is worth highlighting those in which preference is given to special educational institutions (Latvia) (Myskiv, 2014; Lokshina et al., 2021).

We would like to add that special teachers can be full-time employees in general secondary education institutions or invited from special support centers or special schools (Yell et al., 1998). It is important to know that "in Belgium, Australia, Greece, Luxembourg, and the Netherlands, special education teachers are not always employees of the school, but support children with SEN during lessons or out of school hours. They also conduct individual and group consultations with teachers and provide assistance to teachers of general education in planning and developing adaptive materials, as well as introducing an individual training program for these children" (European Agency for Development in Special Needs Education, 2003; Sadova, 2020).

For our research, it is important to highlight the state of inclusive education in educational institutions of Ukraine. Material and technical support of inclusive education in Ukraine is a set of actions by the bodies responsible for implementing inclusive education, which are carried out based on the implementation of laws in order to ensure measures to create favorable conditions for the realization of the right of people with special educational needs to receive accessible and high-quality education.

The problematic issues of the implementing inclusive education in Ukraine include: the absence of a clear mechanism for the implementation of inclusive education; the lack of a unified approach to understanding the terms used in the process of obtaining an education by people with special educational needs; the need to introduce inclusive education at all levels of education in Ukraine (About education, 2017; About higher education, 2014; On approval of the procedure for organizing inclusive education in general



educational institutions, 2011); different subdepartments of educational institutions (special and general); irregular cooperation of relevant ministries; the need to review the mechanism of state financing of educational institutions that provide inclusive educational services; the need to carry out broad educational work among the population regarding the necessity of inclusive education; implementation of a unified national database of statistical electronic data on education for people with special needs; the need to create a system of resource centers for material and technical support of inclusive education in Ukraine; the issue of reducing the network of special educational institutions and creating resource centers for inclusive education on their basis.

In order to improve inclusive education in Ukraine, it is necessary: to carry out a number of changes and supplements to the strategy and the National Action Plan for the implementation of inclusive education in preschool education institutions (early diagnosis and correction of the problem), general secondary education, vocational and technical education, higher education; redistribute the powers of the ministries, where the Ministry of Education and Science of Ukraine is the leading responsible body for the organization of education of people with special educational needs; develop a unified national database of statistical electronic data in the access mode of relevant ministries (the Ministry of Education and Science of Ukraine, the Ministry of Health of Ukraine, the Ministry of Social Policy of Ukraine) and the State Statistics Service of Ukraine (Postanova Kabinetu Ministriv Ukrainy № 872, 2011); take into account the principle of decentralization of power; create a system of resource centers for material and technical support (it is advisable to provide for it in the regions) which will allow to solve the issue of providing educational institutions with special equipment and technical means, adapting the architectural environment of educational institutions to the needs of people with special needs, providing transport services for them (Postanova Kabinetu Ministriv Ukrainy № 784, 2009). The implementation of inclusive education should not completely exclude the functioning of special educational institutions, which should be used as resource centers for personnel training, scientific research in the field of education for people with special needs (Statystychnyi biulleten, 2018). It is also necessary to create an effective system for evaluating the quality of inclusive education.

# CONCLUSIONS AND PROSPECTS OF FURTHER RESEARCH

The implementation of inclusive education in the Ukrainian educational system has a number of urgent problems that must be solved: lack of a clear mechanism for the implementation of inclusive education; lack of a unified approach to understanding the terms used in the process of obtaining an education by people with special educational needs; the need to introduce inclusive education at all levels of education in Ukraine; different sub-departments of educational institutions (special and general); the need to review the mechanism of state financing of educational institutions that provide inclusive educational services; introduction of broad educational work among the population regarding the necessity and positive nature of the implementation of inclusive education.

Current problems of inclusive education in the European Union are as follows: increasing the quality and significance of inclusive education; increasing the number of graduates and reducing the number of people who do not graduate from educational institutions; review and preparation of educational programs that will meet the needs of people with special educational needs obtaining education; stimulating the use of worldleading experience in teaching and scientific research; providing higher education students with wider opportunities to acquire additional skills through study and internships abroad;



strengthening links between inclusive education, research and business; ensuring effective investment into inclusive education.

We consider it necessary to conduct a more detailed study of the process of inclusive education in the countries of the European Union.

#### REFERENCES

1. European Agency for Development in Special Needs Education (2003). *Special needs education in Europe*. Retrieved from https://www.european-agency.org/resources/publications/special-education-across-europe-2003

2. Lokshyna, O., Hlushko, O., Dzhurylo, A., Kravchenko, C., Nikolska, N., Tymenko, M., Shparyk, O. (2021). *Tendentsii rozvytku shkilnoi osvity v krainakh YeS, SShA ta Kytai [Trends in school education in the EU, USA and China]*. Kyiv: KONVI PRINT (in Ukrainian).

3. Myskiv, L. I. (2013). Orhany vykonavchoi vlady yak subiekty realizatsii inkliuzyvnoi osvity v Ukraini. [Bodies of executive power as subjects of implementation of inclusive education in Ukraine]. Yurydychnyi visnyk «Povitriane ta kosmichne pravo» [Legal Bulletin «Air and Space Law»],  $N_{0}$  1 (26), 57–62 (in Ukrainian).

4. Myskiv, L. I. (2014). Pravovi problemy inkliuzyvnoi osvity v Ukraini: [Legal problems of inclusive education in Ukraine]. Kharkiv: Nika Nova (in Ukrainian).

5. Postanova Kabinetu Ministriv Ukrainy [Resolution of the Cabinet of Ministers of Ukraine] № 784 (2009). Pro zatverdzhennia planu zakhodiv shchodo stvorennia bezpereshkodnoho zhyttievoho seredovyshcha dlia osib z obmezhenymy fizychnymy mozhlyvostiamy ta inshykh malomobilnykh hrup naselennia na 2009–2015 roky «Bezbarierna Ukraina»: [On the approval of the plan of measures to create a barrier-free living environment for persons with physical disabilities and other low-mobility population groups for 2009–2015 «Barrier-free Ukraine»]. Retrieved from https://zakon.rada.gov.ua/ laws/show/784-2009-%D0%BF#Text (in Ukrainian).

6. Postanova Kabinetu Ministriv Ukrainy [Resolution of the Cabinet of Ministers of Ukraine] № 872. (2011). Pro zatverdzhennia poriadku orhanizatsii inkliuzyvnoho navchannia u zahalnoosvitnikh navchalnykh zakladakh [On approval of the procedure for organizing inclusive education in general educational institutions]. Retrieved from https://zakon.rada.gov.ua/laws/show/872-2011-%D0%BF (in Ukrainian).

7. Pro osvitu: Zakon Ukrainy [About education: Law of Ukraine] (2017). Vidomosti Verkhovnoi Rady Ukrainy (VVR) [Information of the Verkhovna Rada of Ukraine], № 38–39, 380. Retrieved from https://zakon.rada.gov.ua/laws/show/2145-19 (in Ukrainian).

8. Pro vyshchu osvitu: Zakon Ukrainy [About higher education: Law of Ukraine] (2014). Vidomosti Verkhovnoi Rady Ukrainy (VVR) [Information of the Verkhovna Rada of Ukraine], № 37–38, 2004. Retrieved from https://zakon.rada.gov.ua/laws/show/1556-18/print (in Ukrainian).

9. Rozporiadzhennia Kabinetu Ministriv Ukrainy [Order of the Cabinet of Ministers of Ukraine]  $\mathbb{N}$  245-r (2011). Pro skhvalennia Kontseptsii Derzhavnoi tsilovoi prohramy «Natsionalnyi plan dii z realizatsii Konventsii pro prava invalidiv ta rozvytku systemy reabilitatsii invalidiv na period do 2020 roku» [On the approval of the Concept of the State Target Program «National Action Plan for the Implementation of the Convention on the Rights of the Disabled and the Development of the Rehabilitation System of the



*Disabled for the Period Until 2020*»]. Retrieved from https://zakon.rada.gov.ua/laws/ show/245-2011-%D1%80#Text (in Ukrainian).

10. Sadova, I. I. (2020). Inkliuzyvna osvita v krainakh Yevropy. [Inclusive education in European countries]. Pedahohika formuvannia tvorchoi osobystosti u vyshchii i zahalnoosvitnii shkolakh [Pedagogy of creative personality formation in higher and secondary schools],  $N_{0}$  69, T. 1, 188–192 (in Ukrainian).

11. Statystychnyi biulleten [statistical bulletin] (2018). Zakhyst ditei, yaki potrebuiut osoblyvoi uvahy suspilstva: [Protect children in need of special public attention]. Kyiv: Derzhstat Ukrainy (in Ukrainian).

12. Yell, M., Rogers, D., Rogers, E. (1998). The legal history of special education, hat a long, strange trip it's been! *Remedial and Special Education*, 19 (4), 219–228.

13. Zahalnoderzhavna prohrama [Nationwide program]. (2009) «Natsionalnyi plan dii shchodo realizatsii Konventsii OON pro prava dytyny» [National action plan for the implementation of the UN Convention on the Rights of the Child]: Zakon Ukrainy [Law of Ukraine],  $N_{2}$  1065-VI na period do 2016 roku. Retrieved from https://zakon.rada.gov.ua/laws/show/1065-17#Text (in Ukrainian).