

#### https://doi.org/10.31891/2308-4081/2024-14(1)-6

PhD in Pedagogy, Senior Research Fellow at the Laboratory of Foreign Systems of VET of the Institute of VET (NAES of Ukraine), **EVELINA TSAROVA** Khmelnytskyi Centre for Vocational Education in the Field of Services, Ukraine E-mail: <u>evelina76@ukr.net</u> https://orcid.org/0000-0001-9929-6670

# EXPLORING TRENDS IN PUBLIC-PRIVATE PARTNERSHIPS IN VOCATIONAL EDUCATION: A FOCUS ON THE BALTIC COUNTRIES

#### ABSTRACT

This scientific article delves into the dynamic landscape of vocational education in the Baltic countries – Estonia, Latvia and Lithuania, It focuses on the evolving trends in public-private partnerships (PPPs) within this sector. Vocational education serves as a crucial link between academic learning and industry demands, equipping individuals with the specialized skills needed for the workforce. In recent years, significant strides have been made in enhancing vocational education in the Baltic region through collaborative efforts between government bodies, educational institutions and private enterprises. This article particularly emphasizes emerging trends in PPPs, including joint initiatives, government incentives, digitalization and the impact of the COVID-19 pandemic. Joint initiatives between educational institutions and industry stakeholders are becoming increasingly prevalent, fostering collaboration in curriculum development, internship programmes and skills training tailored to meet industry needs. Government incentives, such as financial support and tax benefits, are encouraging private sector involvement in vocational education, thereby enriching the quality and accessibility of educational offerings. Moreover, digitalization is reshaping vocational education, with PPPs leveraging technology to deliver innovative learning experiences. E-learning platforms, virtual reality simulations and online collaboration tools are being integrated into vocational education curricula, enhancing the effectiveness and relevance of training programmes. However, the COVID-19 pandemic has posed unprecedented challenges, accelerating the adoption of online learning and remote delivery models. By analyzing these trends, the article aims to provide insights into the dynamics of vocational education development and the role of collaboration between public and private sectors in shaping the future of the workforce in the Baltic countries.

*Keywords:* vocational education, public-private partnerships, Baltic countries, joint initiatives, government incentives, digitalization, COVID-19 pandemic.

### ТЕНДЕНЦІЇ РОЗВИТКУ ДЕРЖАВНО-ПРИВАТНОГО ПАРТНЕРСТВА У СФЕРІ ПРОФЕСІЙНОЇ (ПРОФЕСІЙНО-ТЕХНІЧНОЇ) ОСВІТИ У КРАЇНАХ БАЛТІЇ

### АНОТАЦІЯ

У статті досліджено динаміку розвитку професійної (професійно-технічної) освіти в країнах Балтії. Основну увагу зосереджено на провідних тенденціях у галузі державно-приватного партнерства (ДПП) у цьому секторі. Відтак, у Балтійському регіоні зроблено значні кроки у покращенні професійної (професійно-технічної) освіти



завдяки спільним зусиллям між державними органами, навчальними закладами та приватними підприємствами. У статті також з'ясовано основні шляхи удосконалення ДПП, у тому числі спільні ініціативи, стимули з боку уряду, діджиталізацію та вплив пандемії COVID-19. Спільні ініціативи між навчальними закладами та представниками промисловості стають все більш поширеними, сприяючи співпраці в розробці навчальних програм, стажуванні та навчанні навичкам, які відповідають вимогам сучасності. Стимули з боку уряду, такі як фінансова підтримка та податкові пільги, стимулюють участь приватного сектору в професійній (професійнотехнічній) освіті, тим самим забезпечуючи якість та доступність навчальних програм. Крім того, діджиталізація ефективно трансформує професійну (професійнотехнічну) освіту шляхом використання інноваційних освітніх технологій. Електронні платформи для навчання, віртуальна реальність і онлайн-інструменти для співпраці інтегруються в навчальні плани професійної (професійно-технічної) освіти, підвищуючи ефективність та актуальність навчальних програм.

Інтеграція ППП у професійно-технічну освіту означає перехід до більш динамічних моделей навчання, які краще відповідають вимогам галузі. Використовуючи сильні сторони як державного, так і приватного секторів, ці партнерства відіграють важливу роль у забезпеченні високоякісних галузевих освітніх і навчальних програм, які формують навички, необхідні для сучасного конкурентного ринку праці.

З'ясовано, що з використанням колективного досвіду, ресурсів та креативності усіх зацікавлених сторін, країни Балтії будують надійні екосистеми професійної освіти, які розширюють можливості людей, стимулюють економічний розвиток і сприяють соціальній інтеграції.

Ключові слова: професійна (професійно-технічна) освіта, державно-приватне партнерство, країни Балтії, спільні ініціативи, стимули з боку уряду, діджиталізація, пандемія COVID-19.

### **INTRODUCTION**

Vocational education stands as a crucial pillar in workforce development, providing individuals with practical skills and specialized knowledge essential for success in diverse industries. Unlike traditional academic education, vocational training is tailored to specific professions, trades or technical fields, bridging the skills gap by supplying employers with a qualified workforce adept in high-demand areas. This targeted approach not only meets industry needs but also fuels economic growth and innovation by preparing individuals for careers in key sectors such as healthcare, manufacturing, construction and information technology. By offering industry-relevant training and certifications, vocational programmes bolster businesses and drive productivity.

Simultaneously, public-private partnerships (PPPs) emerge as instrumental collaborative arrangements between public-sector entities, such as government agencies or educational institutions, and private-sector organizations, including businesses or non-profit entities (Hodge & Greve, 2019). These partnerships harness the collective expertise, resources and capabilities of both sectors to achieve shared goals and address societal challenges. Within the realm of vocational education, PPPs play a pivotal role in enhancing the quality, relevance and accessibility of vocational training programmes (Osborne, 2000). By uniting government bodies, educational institutions and private enterprises, PPPs stimulate innovation, foster industry alignment and facilitate the development of a skilled workforce tailored to meet present and future labour market demands. Through PPPs,



vocational education programmes gain access to industry insights, state-of-the-art facilities and hands-on training opportunities, thereby enriching offerings and ensuring alignment with industry needs and standards. Private sector partners often contribute funding, expertise in curriculum development and access to industry networks, further enhancing the effectiveness of vocational education initiatives.

Overall, the Baltic countries, Estonia, Latvia and Lithuania, have exhibited a steadfast commitment to vocational education development as a catalyst for economic growth, innovation and social mobility (Bünning, 2006). Through strategic investments, policy reforms and collaborative efforts between government, educational institutions and industry stakeholders, these nations continue to fortify their vocational education systems, equipping individuals with the skills and knowledge necessary for successful careers in the 21<sup>st</sup> century.

# THE AIM OF THE STUDY

Accordingly, this article aims to examine the trends shaping PPPs in vocational education and their implications for the Baltic countries.

## THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK AND RESEARCH METHODS

Without a doubt, the problem of PPPs in vocational education and their implications for the Baltic countries is rather relevant. Many scholars have devoted their research to its particular aspects. They are as follows: the transformation of vocational education and training (VET) in the Baltic States (Bünning, 2006; Hogeforster & Priedulena, 2018; King & McNabb, 2014); the logic of public-private partnerships (Hodge & Greve, 2019; Lewis, 2021; Osborne, 2000; Yong, 2016); work-based learning around the Mare Balticum (Jarke & Hogeforster, 2015; Tūtlys, 2022); the financing of VET in the EU new member states (Masson, 2005); the consequences of COVID-19 for the VET sector (Webb et al., 2022) et al. Besides, special emphasis should be placed on relevant reports on the problem in question prepared by Cedefop (2015; 2020) and OECD (2016).

Nevertheless, the issue of examining the trends that shape PPPs in vocational education and their implications for the Baltic countries remains open.

The research methodology encompasses theoretical and comparative analyses, along with induction, deduction, summarization and generalization techniques.

#### RESULTS

To study the issue in more detail, it is crucial to analyze the implementation of PPPs in the Baltic nations which is motivated by several pivotal factors. Further explanations of these are outlined below.

*Economic Advancement.* PPPs serve as pivotal drivers for fostering economic progress and development within the Baltic countries. Through the utilization of private sector resources and expertise, governments can efficiently finance and deliver crucial infrastructure projects and public services. This stimulates economic activity, attracting investment and spurring overall growth.

*Scarce Public Funds.* Baltic governments often contend with limited public budgets, hindering their ability to independently finance extensive infrastructure endeavours or provide public services (Masson, 2005). PPPs offer a viable alternative by enabling private sector entities to invest in and manage projects in collaboration with the government, thereby easing the strain on public finances.

*Innovation and Specialized Knowledge.* The participation of private sector partners injects innovation, technical expertise and specialized knowledge into PPP ventures (Jarke & Hogeforster, 2015). This enriches the quality and efficiency of service delivery,



leveraging advancements in technology, management practices and operational efficiencies to drive enhancements in public services and infrastructure.

**Risk Allocation.** PPPs facilitate the equitable distribution of risks between public and private partners, mitigating the financial and operational risks associated with large-scale projects. By assigning risks to the party best equipped to manage them, PPPs enhance project resilience, ensuring favourable outcomes for all stakeholders involved (Yong, 2016).

**Expedited Project Completion.** PPPs are frequently associated with expedited project delivery timelines compared to conventional procurement methods. By harnessing private sector financing and expertise, governments can accelerate the planning, design and execution phases of infrastructure projects. This reduces delays and allows the public to reap the benefits of projects sooner.

*Improved Service Standards*. Private sector engagement in PPPs often results in elevated service quality and performance outcomes. Private partners are incentivized to meet stringent performance targets and quality standards, ensuring the effective maintenance of infrastructure assets and efficient service delivery throughout the project's lifecycle.

*Long-Term Cost-Effectiveness.* PPPs are meticulously structured to optimize long-term value for money by aligning project costs with performance outcomes. Through mechanisms, such as lifecycle costing and performance-based contracting, PPPs aim to deliver cost-effective solutions that provide enduring value to taxpayers over the project's lifespan (Hodge & Greve, 2019).

Consequently, the adoption of PPPs in the Baltic countries is driven by a multifaceted ambition to achieve economic development goals, surmount fiscal limitations, capitalize on private sector expertise, manage risks, expedite project delivery, enhance service quality and ensure long-term cost-effectiveness. As governments navigate fiscal challenges and seek innovative avenues to meet infrastructure and public service demands, PPPs are poised to remain pivotal instruments for driving sustainable development across the region.

Several instances of successful PPP initiatives within the sphere of vocational education across the Baltic region are as follows:

1. *Estonia*: *Collaboration between HITSA and Industry*. Estonia's Information Technology Foundation for Education (HITSA) engages in collaboration with various industries to craft vocational education programmes attuned to industry requisites. HITSA actively partners with private sector entities in domains such as information technology, cybersecurity and digital innovation to curate curriculum, furnish internships and furnish practical training avenues for students. This collaborative model ensures vocational education programmes are aligned with prevailing industry standards, thus fortifying graduates' employability and fulfilling the burgeoning demands of Estonia's swiftly evolving technology sector (Musset et al., 2019).

2. Latvia: Establishment of Industry-Led Training Centres. Latvia has established training centres spearheaded by industry entities in conjunction with private sector partners to dispense vocational education and training in sectors with heightened demand. Notably, the Latvian Chamber of Commerce and Industry (LCCI) has forged alliances with prominent companies across sectors such as manufacturing, logistics and hospitality to institute vocational training centres. These centres furnish practical training, apprenticeships and certification programmes meticulously tailored to industry prerequisites, ensuring graduates are adeptly equipped for employment within their respective domains (Cedefop, 2015; 2020).

Порівняльна професійна педагогіка 14(1)/2024
Comparative Professional Pedagogy 14(1)/2024



3. *Lithuania: Implementation of Dual Education Programmes*. Lithuania has instituted dual education programmes in collaboration with private sector corporations to blend classroom instruction with hands-on work experience. Corporations such as Siemens and Telia, among others, collaborate with vocational institutions to afford students on-the-job training, mentorship and avenues for employment. These dual education initiatives empower students to acquire real-world exposure whilst concurrently pursuing their qualifications, augmenting their skill and employability prospects across a spectrum of sectors spanning engineering, technology, telecommunications and beyond (OECD, 2016; Tūtlys, 2022).

4. *Baltic-wide: European Social Fund (ESF) Backed Projects.* The Baltic nations have reaped dividends from European Union (EU) funding via projects underpinned by the European Social Fund (ESF). Such endeavours frequently entail collaborations between public authorities, educational establishments and private sector entities with the overarching aim of enhancing the calibre and relevance of vocational education. ESF-backed ventures concentrate on areas such as skills enhancement, lifelong learning and bolstering vocational education infrastructure, thereby fostering the comprehensive advancement of vocational education throughout the Baltic region (King & McNabb, 2014).

It follows that these efficacious PPP undertakings underscore the efficacy of cooperative ventures between public and private stakeholders in fortifying vocational education and addressing labour market imperatives across the Baltic countries. Through innovative collaborations and bespoke initiatives, vocational education continues to evolve, adeptly meeting the exigencies of a rapidly evolving economy and preparing students for prosperous careers across varied sectors.

Accordingly, PPPs have gained prominence in shaping vocational education in the Baltic region. Several trends underscore the evolving landscape of these partnerships and their profound impact on vocational education. They are as follows:

Alignment with Industry Needs. A notable trend is the increasing alignment between vocational education programmes and industry requirements. Educational institutions collaborate closely with private sector partners to develop tailored curricula that meet the demands of various industries. This ensures that students receive training aligned with current and future labour market needs, thereby enhancing their employability and facilitating smoother transitions into the workforce.

*Integration of Digital Technologies.* Another significant trend is the integration of digital technologies into vocational education. With the rapid advancement of technology, vocational programmes are incorporating digital tools and platforms to deliver innovative learning experiences. This includes leveraging e-learning platforms, virtual reality simulations and online collaboration tools to enhance the accessibility of vocational training and equip students with essential digital skills demanded in today's labour market.

*Emphasis on Work-Based Learning.* Work-based learning initiatives are gaining traction in the Baltic region. These initiatives offer students opportunities to gain practical experience through internships, apprenticeships and industry placements. By engaging directly with employers, students can apply theoretical knowledge in real-world settings, develop practical skills and establish valuable networks within their chosen industries.

Government Endorsement and Support. Baltic governments increasingly recognize the significance of PPPs in vocational education and extend support through various incentives and initiatives. This includes providing funding opportunities, establishing regulatory frameworks that facilitate partnership formation and introducing



policy initiatives aimed at fostering collaboration between public and private stakeholders. Government backing is vital for nurturing the growth of PPPs and ensuring their long-term viability.

**Prioritization of Quality Assurance.** Ensuring the quality and effectiveness of vocational education programmes is a focal point for PPPs in the Baltic region. Public and private partners implement robust quality assurance mechanisms to monitor and evaluate programme outcomes. This involves conducting regular assessments, establishing feedback mechanisms and implementing continuous improvement processes to enhance the relevance and effectiveness of vocational training programmes.

*Impact of the Covid-19 Pandemic.* The COVID-19 pandemic has posed unprecedented challenges to the vocational education sector, necessitating rapid adaptation to remote learning and online delivery models (Webb et al., 2022). PPPs have played a crucial role in facilitating this transition, enabling educational institutions to continue providing quality training amidst the pandemic. The crisis has also highlighted the importance of digital infrastructure and flexible learning pathways in vocational education.

Therefore, these trends underscore the dynamic nature of PPPs in vocational education across the Baltic region. By aligning with industry needs, embracing digital technologies, emphasizing work-based learning, receiving government support and prioritizing quality assurance, PPPs play a pivotal role in shaping the future of vocational education and workforce development in the Baltic countries.

However, it is important to acknowledge future trends and opportunities for further development of vocational education through PPPs in the Baltic countries that unveil several promising avenues for growth and innovation.

First, future trends suggest a deepening of partnerships between vocational education institutions and a broader range of industries. Beyond traditional sectors, emerging industries such as renewable energy, digital technology and healthcare are expected to play a significant role in shaping vocational education. By forging alliances with these sectors, vocational programmes can stay abreast of evolving industry needs and ensure the relevance of their training offerings (Lewis, 2021).

Second, the rapid advancement of technology presents an opportunity to integrate emerging technologies into vocational education. Virtual reality (VR), augmented reality (AR), artificial intelligence (AI) and Internet of Things (IoT) are poised to revolutionize vocational training by offering immersive learning experiences, simulating real-world scenarios and enhancing hands-on skill development. PPPs can facilitate the adoption of these technologies by providing access to industry expertise, funding and technological infrastructure (Hogeforster & Priedulena, 2018; Osborne, 2000).

Next, with the evolving nature of work and technological advancements, there is a growing need for continuous upskilling and reskilling. Future vocational education programmes are likely to adopt a lifelong learning approach, offering opportunities for professionals to acquire new skills and adapt to changing job requirements throughout their careers. PPPs can support this trend by establishing flexible training pathways, micro-credentialing programmes and collaborative initiatives between educational institutions and employers.

Meanwhile, future vocational education initiatives may place a greater emphasis on fostering entrepreneurship and innovation among students. PPPs can facilitate entrepreneurship education, mentorship programmes and incubation centres where aspiring entrepreneurs can develop their ideas into viable businesses. By nurturing a culture of



innovation, vocational education institutions can empower students to become drivers of economic growth and job creation in the Baltic region.

Moreover, ensuring equitable access to vocational education is crucial for promoting social mobility and economic development. Future trends may involve the expansion of online learning platforms, distance education programmes and mobile learning initiatives to reach underserved populations, including rural communities and individuals with special needs. PPPs can play a pivotal role in expanding access to vocational education by leveraging digital technologies, partnering with community organizations and tailoring programmes to meet the needs of diverse learners.

Finally, as vocational education becomes increasingly globalized, there is an opportunity for the Baltic countries to collaborate with international partners to exchange best practices, share resources and enhance programme quality. PPPs can facilitate international partnerships, joint research projects and student exchange programmes, allowing vocational education institutions in the Baltic region to benefit from global perspectives and experiences.

## CONCLUSIONS AND PROSPECTS OF FURTHER RESEARCH

In conclusion, the trends in the development of PPPs in vocational education in the Baltic countries underscore the region's steadfast commitment to fostering innovation, enhancing workforce readiness and driving economic growth. The collaborative efforts seen through joint initiatives, government incentives, digitalization and responses to the COVID-19 pandemic are reshaping the landscape of vocational education, presenting a promising outlook for the future. These trends are not only indicative of the Baltic countries' proactive approach to meeting the evolving needs of their economies but also signify a strategic response to global challenges and opportunities.

The integration of PPPs into vocational education signifies a shift towards more dynamic and responsive training models that better align with industry demands. By leveraging the strengths of both public and private sectors, these partnerships are instrumental in delivering high-quality, industry-relevant education and training programmes that equip individuals with the skills needed to thrive in today's competitive labour market.

Looking ahead, sustained collaboration between public and private stakeholders will be essential in ensuring the continued success and sustainability of vocational education systems in the Baltic region. Stakeholders must continue to work together to identify emerging trends, address challenges, and seize opportunities for innovation and growth. By harnessing the collective expertise, resources and creativity of all stakeholders, the Baltic countries can build robust vocational education ecosystems that empower individuals, stimulate economic development and foster social inclusion. Through strategic collaboration and a shared commitment to excellence, the Baltic region can position itself as a global leader in vocational education and workforce development.

Further research should focus on the current status of public-private partnerships in vocational education institutions in other leading European countries.

# REFERENCES

1. Bünning, F. (2006). The transformation of vocational education and training (vet) in the Baltic States – Survey of reforms and developments. Springer. https://www./google.com.ua/books/edition/The\_Transformation\_of\_Vocational\_Educati/oDogPHuWwd 8C?hl=ru&gbpv=1

Порівняльна професійна педагогіка 14(1)/2024
Comparative Professional Pedagogy 14(1)/2024



2. Cedefop. (2015). *Vocational education and training in Latvia: Short description*. Publications Office of the European Union. https://www.cedefop.europa.eu/files/4134\_en.pdf

3. Cedefop. (2020). Latvia, Baltic states develop common approaches to workbased learning. https://www.cedefop.europa.eu/en/news/latvia-baltic-states-develop-commonapproaches-work-based-learning

4. Hodge, G. A., & Greve, C. (2019). *The logic of public-private partnerships*. Edward Elgar Publishing. https://www.google.com.ua/books/edition/The\_Logic/\_/of\_/ Public\_/Private\_Partnerships/BKGdDwAAQBAJ?hl=ru&gbpv=0

5. Hogeforster, J., & Priedulena, E. (Eds.). (2018). Common vocational training to master craftsmanship in the Baltic Sea Region. Baltic Sea Academy. https://www./google.com.ua/books/edition/Common\_Vocational\_Training\_to\_Master\_cra/0yNrDwAAQ BAJ?hl=ru&gbpv=1

6. Jarke, P., & Hogeforster, J. (Eds.). (2015). *Work-based learning around the Mare Balticum*. Baltic Sea Academy. https://www.google.com.ua/books/edition/Work\_/ based\_learning\_around\_the\_mare\_balt/Dgt-BwAAQBAJ?hl=ru&gbpv=0

7. King, G. J., & McNabb, D. E. (2014). *Nation-building in the Baltic States: Transforming governance, social welfare, and security in Northern Europe*. Taylor & Francis. https://www.google.com.ua/books/edition/Nation\_Building\_in\_the\_Baltic\_States/aH7OBQAAQBAJ?hl=ru&gbpv=0

8. Lewis, M. K. (2021). *Rethinking public private partnerships*. Edward Elgar Publishing. https://www.google.com.ua/books/edition/Rethinking\_Public\_Private\_Partnerships/ RXg8EAAAQBAJ?hl=ru&gbpv=0

9. Masson, J.-R. (2005). Financing vocational education and training in the EU new member states and candidate countries: Recent trends and challenges. European Training Foundation. https://www.etf.europa.eu/sites/default/files/m/C12578310056925BC125712/ A0064D1BB\_NOTE6MNPHG.pdf

10. Musset, P., Field, S., Mann, A., & Bergseng, B. (2019). *OECD reviews of vocational education and training vocational education and training in Estonia*. OECD Publishing. https://www.google.com.ua/books/edition/OECD\_Reviews\_of\_Vocational\_Education/\_and/K2aQDwAAQBAJ?hl=ru&gbpv=0

11. OECD. (2016). *Investing in Youth: Lithuania*. OECD Publishing. https://www./ google.com.ua/books/edition/Investing\_in\_Youth\_Lithuania/P5ugCwAAQBAJ?hl=ru&gbp v=0

12. Osborne, S. (2000). *Public-private partnerships: Theory and practice in international perspective*. Taylor & Francis. https://www.google.com.ua/books/edition/Public\_Private\_Partnerships/IUeFAgAAQBAJ?hl=ru&gbpv=0

13. Tūtlys, V. (2022). Case study Lithuania. In The future of vocational education and training in Europe volume 2: Delivering IVET: institutional diversification and/or expansion. Thessaloniki: Cedefop. https://www.cedefop.europa.eu/files/lithuania\_future\_/ of\_vet\_vol.2.pdf

14. Webb, E., Winkelmann, J., Scarpetti, G., Behmane, D., Habicht, T., Kahur, K., Kasekamp, K., Köhler, K., Miščikienė, L., Misins, J., Reinap, M., Slapšinskaitė-Dackevičienė, A., Võrk, A., & Karanikolos, M. (2022). Lessons learned from the Baltic countries' response to the first wave of COVID-19. *Health policy (Amsterdam, Netherlands)*, *126*(5), 438–445. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.healthpol.2021.12.003

15. Yong, H. K. (2016). *Public-private partnerships policy and practice: A reference guide*. Commonwealth Secretarial. https://www.google.com.ua/books/edition/Public\_/ private\_Partnerships\_Policy\_and\_P/tnuFUUjP9f8C?hl=ru&gbpv=0